## Capture-recapture experiments

4) Capture-recapture experiments

- Inference in finite populations
- Binomial capture model
- Two-stage capture-recapture
- Open population
- Accept-Reject methods
- Arnason-Schwarz's Model


## Inference in finite populations

Problem of estimating an unknown population size, $N$, based on partial observation of this population: domain of survey sampling

Warning
We do not cover the official Statistics/stratified type of survey based on a preliminary knowledge of the structure of the population

## Numerous applications

- Biology \& Ecology for estimating the size of herds, of fish or whale populations, etc.
- Sociology \& Demography for estimating the size of populations at risk, including homeless people, prostitutes, illegal migrants, drug addicts, etc.
- official Statistics in the U.S. and French census undercount procedures
- Economics \& Finance in credit scoring, defaulting companies, etc.,
- Fraud detection phone, credit card, etc.
- Document authentication historical documents, forgery, etc.,
- Software debugging

Capture-recapture experiments
Inference in finite populations

## Setup

Size $N$ of the whole population is unknown but samples (with fixed or random sizes) can be extracted from the population.

## The binomial capture model

Simplest model of all: joint capture of $n^{+}$individuals from a population of size $N$.

Population size $N \in \mathbb{N}^{*}$ is the parameter of interest, but there exists a nuisance parameter, the probability $p \in[0,1]$ of capture [under assumption of independent captures]

Sampling model

$$
n^{+} \sim \mathscr{B}(N, p)
$$

and corresponding likelihood

$$
\ell\left(N, p \mid n^{+}\right)=\binom{N}{n^{+}} p^{n^{+}}(1-p)^{N-n^{+}} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}}
$$

## Bayesian inference (1)

## Under vague prior

$$
\pi(N, p) \propto N^{-1} \mathbb{I}_{\mathbb{N}^{*}}(N) \mathbb{I}_{[0,1]}(p),
$$

posterior distribution of $N$ is

$$
\begin{aligned}
\pi\left(N \mid n^{+}\right) & \propto \frac{N!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} N^{-1} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}} \mathbb{I}_{\mathbb{N}^{*}}(N) \int_{0}^{1} p^{n^{+}}(1-p)^{N-n^{+}} d p \\
& \propto \frac{(N-1)!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} \frac{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!}{(N+1)!} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+} \mathrm{V} 1} \\
& =\frac{1}{N(N+1)} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+} \mathrm{V} 1} .
\end{aligned}
$$

where $n^{+} \vee 1=\max \left(n^{+}, 1\right)$

## Bayesian inference (2)

If we use the uniform prior

$$
\pi(N, p) \propto \mathbb{I}_{\{1, \ldots, S\}}(N) \mathbb{I}_{[0,1]}(p),
$$

the posterior distribution of $N$ is

$$
\pi\left(N \mid n^{+}\right) \propto \frac{1}{N+1} \mathbb{I}_{\left\{n^{+} \vee 1, \ldots, S\right\}}(N) .
$$

## Capture-recapture data

## European dippers

Birds closely dependent on streams, feeding on underwater invertebrates Capture-recapture data on dippers over years 1981-1987 in 3 zone of $200 \mathrm{~km}^{2}$ in eastern France with markings and recaptures of breeding adults each year, during the breeding period from early March to early
 June.

## eurodip

Each row of 7 digits corresponds to a capture-recapture story: 0 stands for absence of capture and, else, 1, 2 or 3 represents the zone of capture.
E.g.

1000000
1300000
0222122
means: first dipper only captured the first year [in zone 1], second dipper captured in years 1981-1982 and moved from zone 1 to zone 3 between those years, third dipper captured in years 1982-1987 in zone 2

## The two-stage capture-recapture experiment

Extension to the above with two capture periods plus a marking stage:
(1) $n_{1}$ individuals from a population of size $N$ captured [sampled without replacement]
(2) captured individuals marked and released
(3) $n_{2}$ individuals captured during second identical sampling experiment
(4) $m_{2}$ individuals out of the $n_{2}$ 's bear the identification mark [captured twice]

## The two-stage capture-recapture model

For closed populations [fixed population size $N$ throughout experiment, constant capture probability $p$ for all individuals, and independence between individuals/captures], binomial models:

$$
\begin{gathered}
n_{1} \sim \mathscr{B}(N, p), \quad m_{2} \mid n_{1} \sim \mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}, p\right) \quad \text { and } \\
n_{2}-m_{2} \mid n_{1}, m_{2} \sim \mathscr{B}\left(N-n_{1}, p\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

## The two-stage capture-recapture likelihood

Corresponding likelihood $\ell\left(N, p \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2}\right)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\binom{N-n_{1}}{n_{2}-m_{2}} & p^{n_{2}-m_{2}}(1-p)^{N-n_{1}-n_{2}+m_{2}} \mathbb{I}_{\left\{0, \ldots, N-n_{1}\right\}}\left(n_{2}-m_{2}\right) \\
& \times\binom{ n_{1}}{m_{2}} p^{m_{2}}(1-p)^{n_{1}-m_{2}}\binom{N}{n_{1}} p^{n_{1}}(1-p)^{N-n_{1}} \mathbb{I}_{\{0, \ldots, N\}}\left(n_{1}\right) \\
& \propto \frac{N!}{\left(N-n_{1}-n_{2}+m_{2}\right)!} p^{n_{1}+n_{2}}(1-p)^{2 N-n_{1}-n_{2}} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}} \\
& \propto\binom{N}{n^{+}} p^{n^{c}}(1-p)^{2 N-n^{c}} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}}
\end{aligned}
$$

where $n^{c}=n_{1}+n_{2}$ and $n^{+}=n_{1}+\left(n_{2}-m_{2}\right)$ are total number of captures/captured individuals over both periods

## Bayesian inference (1)

Under prior $\pi(N, p)=\pi(N) \pi(p)$ where $\pi(p)$ is $\mathscr{U}([0,1])$, conditional posterior distribution on $p$ is

$$
\pi\left(p \mid N, n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2}\right)=\pi\left(p \mid N, n^{c}\right) \propto p^{n^{c}}(1-p)^{2 N-n^{c}}
$$

that is,

$$
p \mid N, n^{c} \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(n^{c}+1,2 N-n^{c}+1\right) .
$$

Marginal posterior distribution of $N$ more complicated. If $\pi(N)=\mathbb{I}_{\mathbb{N}^{*}}(N)$,

$$
\pi\left(N \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2}\right) \propto\binom{N}{n^{+}} B\left(n^{c}+1,2 N-n^{c}+1\right) \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+} \vee 1}
$$

[Beta-Pascal distribution]

## Bayesian inference (2)

Same problem if $\pi(N)=N^{-1} \mathbb{I}_{\mathbb{N}^{*}}(N)$.

## Computations

Since $N \in \mathbb{N}$, always possible to approximate the missing normalizing factor in $\pi\left(N \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2}\right)$ by summing in $N$. Approximation errors become a problem when $N$ and $n^{+}$are large.

Under proper uniform prior,

$$
\pi(N) \propto \mathbb{I}_{\{1, \ldots, S\}}(N)
$$

posterior distribution of $N$ proportional to

$$
\pi\left(N \mid n^{+}\right) \propto\binom{N}{n^{+}} \frac{\Gamma\left(2 N-n^{c}+1\right)}{\Gamma(2 N+2)} \mathbb{I}_{\left\{n^{+} \vee 1, \ldots, S\right\}}(N) .
$$

and can be computed with no approximation error.

## The Darroch model

Simpler version of the above: conditional on both samples sizes $n_{1}$ and $n_{2}$,

$$
m_{2} \mid n_{1}, n_{2} \sim \mathscr{H}\left(N, n_{2}, n_{1} / N\right) .
$$

Under uniform prior on $N \sim \mathscr{U}(\{1, \ldots, S\})$, posterior distribution of $N$

$$
\pi\left(N \mid m_{2}\right) \propto\binom{n_{1}}{m_{2}}\binom{N-n_{1}}{n_{2}-m_{2}} /\binom{N}{n_{2}} \mathbb{I}_{\{n+\vee 1, \ldots, S\}}(N)
$$

and posterior expectations computed numerically by simple summations.

## eurodip

For the two first years and $S=400$, posterior distribution of $N$ for the Darroch model given by
$\pi\left(N \mid m_{2}\right) \propto\left(n-n_{1}\right)!\left(N-n_{2}\right)!/\left\{\left(n-n_{1}-n_{2}+m_{2}\right)!N!\right\} \mathbb{I}_{\{71, \ldots, 400\}}(N)$,
with inverse normalization factor

$$
\sum_{k=71}^{400}\left(k-n_{1}\right)!\left(k-n_{2}\right)!/\left\{\left(k-n_{1}-n_{2}+m_{2}\right)!k!\right\}
$$

Influence of prior hyperparameter $S$ (for $m_{2}=11$ ):

| $S$ | 100 | 150 | 200 | 250 | 300 | 350 | 400 | 450 | 500 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathbb{E}\left[N \mid m_{2}\right]$ | 95 | 125 | 141 | 148 | 151 | 151 | 152 | 152 | 152 |

## Gibbs sampler for 2-stage capture-recapture

If $n^{+}>0$, both conditional posterior distributions are standard, since

$$
\begin{aligned}
p \mid n^{c}, N & \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(n^{c}+1,2 N-n^{c}+1\right) \\
N-n^{+} \mid n^{+}, p & \sim \mathscr{N} e g\left(n^{+}, 1-(1-p)^{2}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Therefore, joint distribution of $(N, p)$ can be approximated by a Gibbs sampler

## $T$-stage capture-recapture model

Further extension to the two-stage capture-recapture model: series of $T$ consecutive captures.
$n_{t}$ individuals captured at period $1 \leq t \leq T$, and $m_{t}$ recaptured individuals (with the convention that $m_{1}=0$ )

$$
n_{1} \sim \mathscr{B}(N, p)
$$

and, conditional on earlier captures/recaptures $(2 \leq j \leq T)$,

$$
\begin{array}{r}
m_{j} \sim \mathscr{B}\left(\sum_{t=1}^{j-1}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right), p\right) \text { and } \\
n_{j}-m_{j} \sim \mathscr{B}\left(N-\sum_{t=1}^{j-1}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right), p\right) .
\end{array}
$$

$\left\llcorner_{\text {Capture-recapture experiments }}\right.$
Two-stage capture-recapture

## $T$-stage capture-recapture likelihood

Likelihood $\ell\left(N, p \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2} \ldots, n_{T}, m_{T}\right)$ given by

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \binom{N}{n_{1}} p^{n_{1}}(1-p)^{N-n_{1}} \prod_{j=2}^{T}\left[\binom{N-\sum_{t=1}^{j-1}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right)}{n_{j}-m_{j}} p^{n_{j}-m_{j}}\right. \\
& \quad \times(1-p)^{N-\sum_{t=1}^{j}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right)\binom{\sum_{t=1}^{j-1}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right)}{m_{j}}} \\
& \left.\quad \times p^{m_{j}}(1-p)^{\sum_{t=1}^{j-1}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right)-m_{j}}\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Sufficient statistics

Simplifies into
$\ell\left(N, p \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2} \ldots, n_{T}, m_{T}\right) \propto \frac{N!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} p^{n^{c}}(1-p)^{T N-n^{c}} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}}$ with the sufficient statistics

$$
n^{+}=\sum_{t=1}^{T}\left(n_{t}-m_{t}\right) \quad \text { and } \quad n^{c}=\sum_{t=1}^{T} n_{t}
$$

total number of captured individuals/captures over the $T$ periods

## Bayesian inference (1)

Under noninformative prior $\pi(N, p)=1 / N$, joint posterior

$$
\pi\left(N, p \mid n^{+}, n^{c}\right) \propto \frac{(N-1)!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} p^{n^{c}}(1-p)^{T N-n^{c}} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+} \vee 1}
$$

leads to conditional posterior

$$
p \mid N, n^{+}, n^{c} \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(n^{c}+1, T N-n^{c}+1\right)
$$

and marginal posterior

$$
\pi\left(N \mid n^{+}, n^{c}\right) \propto \frac{(N-1)!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} \frac{\left(T N-n^{c}\right)!}{(T N+1)!} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n^{+}, \mathrm{v} 1}
$$

which is computable [under previous provisions].
Alternative Gibbs sampler also available.

## Bayesian inference (2)

Under prior $N \sim \mathscr{U}(\{1, \ldots, S\})$ and $p \sim \mathscr{U}([0,1])$,

$$
\pi\left(N \mid n^{+}\right) \propto\binom{N}{n^{+}} \frac{\left(T N-n^{c}\right)!}{(T N+1)!} \mathbb{I}_{\left\{n^{+} \vee 1, \ldots, S\right\}}(N)
$$

## eurodip

For the whole set of observations, $T=7, n^{+}=294$ and $n^{c}=519$.
For $S=400$, the posterior expectation of $N$ is equal to 372.89 .
For $S=2500$, it is 373.99 .

## Computational difficulties

E.g., heterogeneous capture-recapture model where individuals are captured at time $1 \leq t \leq T$ with probability $p_{t}$ with both $N$ and the $p_{t}$ 's are unknown.

Corresponding likelihood

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \ell\left(N, p_{1}, \ldots, p_{T} \mid n_{1}, n_{2}, m_{2} \ldots, n_{T}, m_{T}\right) \\
& \\
& \propto \frac{N!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} \prod_{t=1}^{T} p_{t}^{n_{t}}\left(1-p_{t}\right)^{N-n_{t}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Computational difficulties (cont'd)

Associated prior $N \sim \mathscr{P}(\lambda)$ and

$$
\alpha_{t}=\log \left(p_{t} / 1-p_{t}\right) \sim \mathscr{N}\left(\mu_{t}, \sigma^{2}\right)
$$

where the $\mu_{t}$ 's and $\sigma$ are known.
Posterior

$$
\begin{aligned}
\pi\left(\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{T}, N \mid, n_{1}, \ldots, n_{T}\right) \propto & \frac{N!}{\left(N-n^{+}\right)!} \frac{\lambda^{N}}{N!} \prod_{t=1}^{T}\left(1+e^{\alpha_{t}}\right)^{-N} \\
& \times \prod_{t=1}^{T} \exp \left\{\alpha_{t} n_{t}-\frac{1}{2 \sigma^{2}}\left(\alpha_{t}-\mu_{t}\right)^{2}\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

much less manageable computationally.

## Open populations

More realistically, population size does not remain fixed over time: probability $q$ for each individual to leave the population at each time [or between each capture episode]

First occurrence of missing variable model.
Simplified version where only individuals captured during the first experiment are marked and their subsequent recaptures are registered.

## Working example

Three successive capture experiments with

$$
\begin{aligned}
n_{1} & \sim \mathscr{B}(N, p), \\
r_{1} \mid n_{1} & \sim \mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}, q\right), \\
c_{2} \mid n_{1}, r_{1} & \sim \mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}-r_{1}, p\right), \\
r_{2} \mid n_{1}, r_{1} & \sim \mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}-r_{1}, q\right) \\
c_{3} \mid n_{1}, r_{1}, r_{2} & \sim \mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}, p\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

where only $n_{1}, c_{2}$ and $c_{3}$ are observed.
Variables $r_{1}$ and $r_{2}$ not available and therefore part of unknowns like parameters $N, p$ and $q$.

## Bayesian inference

Likelihood

$$
\begin{gathered}
\binom{N}{n_{1}} p^{n_{1}}(1-p)^{N-n_{1}}\binom{n_{1}}{r_{1}} q^{r_{1}}(1-q)^{n_{1}-r_{1}}\binom{n_{1}-r_{1}}{c_{2}} p^{c_{2}}(1-p)^{n_{1}-r_{1}-c_{2}} \\
\binom{n_{1}-r_{1}}{r_{2}} q^{r_{2}}(1-q)^{n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}}\binom{n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}}{c_{3}} p^{c_{3}}(1-p)^{n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}}
\end{gathered}
$$

and prior

$$
\pi(N, p, q)=N^{-1} \mathbb{I}_{[0,1]}(p) \mathbb{I}_{[0,1]}(q)
$$

## Full conditionals for Gibbs sampling

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \pi\left(p \mid N, q, \mathcal{D}^{*}\right) \propto p^{n_{+}}(1-p)^{u_{+}} \\
& \pi\left(q \mid N, p, \mathcal{D}^{*}\right) \propto q^{c_{1}+c_{2}}(1-q)^{2 n_{1}-2 r_{1}-r_{2}} \\
& \pi\left(N \mid p, q, \mathcal{D}^{*}\right) \propto \frac{(N-1)!}{\left(N-n_{1}\right)!}(1-p)^{N} \mathbb{I}_{N \geq n_{1}} \\
& \pi\left(r_{1} \mid p, q, n_{1}, c_{2}, c_{3}, r_{2}\right) \propto \frac{\left(n_{1}-r_{1}\right)!q^{r_{1}}(1-q)^{-2 r_{1}}(1-p)^{-2 r_{1}}}{r_{1}!\left(n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}\right)!\left(n_{1}-c_{2}-r_{1}\right)!} \\
& \pi\left(r_{2} \mid p, q, n_{1}, c_{2}, c_{3}, r_{1}\right) \propto \frac{q^{r_{2}[(1-p)(1-q)]^{-r_{2}}}}{r_{2}!\left(n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}\right)!} \\
& \text { where }
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{D}^{*} & =\left(n_{1}, c_{2}, c_{3}, r_{1}, r_{2}\right) \\
u_{1} & =N-n_{1}, u_{2}=n_{1}-r_{1}-c_{2}, u_{3}=n_{1}-r_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3} \\
n_{+} & =n_{1}+c_{2}+c_{3}, u_{+}=u_{1}+u_{2}+u_{3}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Full conditionals (2)

Therefore,

$$
\begin{aligned}
p \mid N, q, \mathcal{D}^{*} & \sim \mathcal{B} e\left(n_{+}+1, u_{+}+1\right) \\
q \mid N, p, \mathcal{D}^{*} & \sim \mathcal{B} e\left(r_{1}+r_{2}+1,2 n_{1}-2 r_{1}-r_{2}+1\right) \\
N-n_{1} \mid p, q, \mathcal{D}^{*} & \sim \mathcal{N} e g\left(n_{1}, p\right) \\
r_{2} \mid p, q, n_{1}, c_{2}, c_{3}, r_{1} & \sim \mathcal{B}\left(n_{1}-r_{1}-c_{3}, \frac{q}{1+(1-q)(1-p)}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

$r_{1}$ has a less conventional distribution, but, since $n_{1}$ not extremely large, possible to compute the probability that $r_{1}$ is equal to one of the values in $\left\{0,1, \ldots, \min \left(n_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}, n_{1}-c_{2}\right)\right\}$.

Capture-recapture experiments
Open population

## eurodip

$n_{1}=22, c_{2}=11$ and $c_{3}=6$ MCMC approximations to the posterior expectations of $N$ and $p$ equal to 57 and 0.40


Capture-recapture experiments
Open population

## eurodip

$n_{1}=22, c_{2}=11$ and $c_{3}=6$ MCMC approximations to the posterior expectations of $N$ and $p$ equal to 57 and 0.40


## Accept-Reject methods

- Many distributions from which it is difficult, or even impossible, to directly simulate.
- Technique that only require us to know the functional form of the target $\pi$ of interest up to a multiplicative constant.
- Key to this method is to use a proposal density $g$ [as in Metropolis-Hastings]


## Principle

Given a target density $\pi$, find a density $g$ and a constant $M$ such that

$$
\pi(x) \leq M g(x)
$$

on the support of $\pi$.

Accept-Reject algorithm is then
(1) Generate $X \sim g, U \sim \mathcal{U}_{[0,1]}$;
(2) Accept $Y=X$ if $U \leq \frac{f(X)}{M g(X)}$;
(3) Return to 1 . otherwise.

## Validation of Accept-Reject

This algorithm produces a variable $Y$ distributed according to $f$

## Fundamental theorem of simulation

Simulating

$$
X \sim f(x)
$$

is equivalent to simulating

$$
(X, U) \sim \mathcal{U}\{(x, u): 0<u<\pi(x)\}
$$



## Two interesting properties:

- First, Accept-Reject provides a generic method to simulate from any density $\pi$ that is known up to a multiplicative factor Particularly important for Bayesian calculations since

$$
\pi(\theta \mid x) \propto \pi(\theta) f(x \mid \theta)
$$

is specified up to a normalizing constant

- Second, the probability of acceptance in the algorithm is $1 / M$, e.g., expected number of trials until a variable is accepted is $M$


## Application to the open population model

Since full conditional distribution of $r_{1}$ non-standard, rather than using exhaustive enumeration of all probabilities
$\mathbb{P}\left(m_{1}=k\right)=\pi(k)$ and then sampling from this distribution, try to use a proposal based on a binomial upper bound.

Take $g$ equal to the binomial $\mathscr{B}\left(n_{1}, q_{1}\right)$ with

$$
q_{1}=q /(1-q)^{2}(1-p)^{2}
$$

## Proposal bound

$\pi(k) / g(k)$ proportional to

$$
\frac{\binom{n_{1}-c_{2}}{k}\left(1-q_{1}\right)^{k}\binom{n_{1}-k}{r_{2}+c_{3}}}{\binom{n_{1}}{k}}=\frac{\left(n_{1}-c_{2}\right)!}{\left(r_{2}+c_{3}\right)!n_{1}!} \frac{\left(\left(n_{1}-k\right)!\right)^{2}\left(1-q_{1}\right)^{k}}{\left(n_{1}-c_{2}-k\right)!\left(n_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}-k\right)!}
$$

decreasing in $k$, therefore bounded by

$$
\frac{\left(n_{1}-c_{2}\right)!}{\left(r_{2}+c_{3}\right)!} \frac{n_{1}!}{\left(n_{1}-c_{2}\right)!\left(n_{1}-r_{2}-c_{3}\right)!}=\binom{n_{1}}{r_{2}+c_{3}}
$$

This is not the constant $M$ because of unnormalised densities [ $M$ may also depend on $q_{1}$ ]. Therefore the average acceptance rate is undetermined and requires an extra Monte Carlo experiment

## Arnason-Schwarz Model

Representation of a capture recapture experiment as a collection of individual histories: for each individual captured at least once, individual characteristics of interest (location, weight, social status, \&tc.) registered at each capture.

Possibility that individuals vanish from the [open] population between two capture experiments.

## Parameters of interest

Study the movements of individuals between zones/strata rather than estimating population size.

Two types of variables associated with each individual $i=1, \ldots, n$
(1) a variable for its location [partly observed],

$$
\mathbf{z}_{i}=\left(z_{(i, t)}, t=1, . ., \tau\right)
$$

where $\tau$ is the number of capture periods,
(2) a binary variable for its capture history [completely observed],

$$
\mathbf{x}_{i}=\left(x_{(i, t)}, t=1, . ., \tau\right)
$$

## Migration \& deaths

$z_{(i, t)}=r$ when individual $i$ is alive in stratum $r$ at time $t$ and denote $z_{(i, t)}=\dagger$ for the case when it is dead at time $t$.

Variable $\mathbf{z}_{i}$ sometimes called migration process of individual $i$ as when animals moving between geographical zones.
E.g.,

$$
\mathbf{x}_{i}=110111000 \quad \text { and } \quad \mathbf{z}_{i}=12 \cdot 311 \cdots
$$

for which a possible completed $\mathbf{z}_{i}$ is

$$
\mathbf{z}_{i}=1213112 \dagger \dagger
$$

meaning that animal died between 7th and 8th captures

Capture-recapture experiments

- Arnason-Schwarz's Model


## No tag recovery

We assume that

- $\dagger$ is absorbing
- $z_{(i, t)}=\dagger$ always corresponds to $x_{(i, t)}=0$.
- the $\left(\mathbf{x}_{i}, \mathbf{z}_{i}\right)$ 's $(i=1, \ldots, n)$ are independent
- each vector $\mathbf{z}_{i}$ is a Markov chain on $\mathfrak{K} \cup\{\dagger\}$ with uniform initial probability on $\mathfrak{K}$.


## Reparameterisation

Parameters of the Arnason-Schwarz model are
(1) capture probabilities

$$
p_{t}(r)=\mathbb{P}\left(x_{(i, t)}=1 \mid z_{(i, t)}=r\right)
$$

(2) transition probabilities

$$
q_{t}(r, s)=\mathbb{P}\left(z_{(i, t+1)}=s \mid z_{(i, t)}=r\right) \quad r \in \mathfrak{K}, s \in \mathfrak{K} \cup\{\dagger\}, \quad q_{t}(\dagger, \dagger)=1
$$

(3) survival probabilities $\phi_{t}(r)=1-q_{t}(r, \dagger)$
(4) inter-strata movement probabilities $\psi_{t}(r, s)$ such that

$$
q_{t}(r, s)=\phi_{t}(r) \times \psi_{t}(r, s) \quad r \in \mathfrak{K}, s \in \mathfrak{K} .
$$

Capture-recapture experiments
LArnason-Schwarz's Model

## Modelling

Likelihood

$$
\begin{aligned}
\ell\left(\left(\mathbf{x}_{1}, \mathbf{z}_{1}\right), \ldots,\left(\mathbf{x}_{n}, \mathbf{z}_{n}\right)\right) \propto & \prod_{i=1}^{n}\left[\prod_{t=1}^{\tau} p_{t}\left(z_{(i, t)}\right)^{x_{(i, t)}}\left(1-p_{t}\left(z_{(i, t)}\right)\right)^{1-x_{(i, t)} \times}\right. \\
& \left.\prod_{t=1}^{\tau-1} q_{t}\left(z_{(i, t)}, z_{(i, t+1)}\right)\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Conjugate priors

Capture and survival parameters

$$
p_{t}(r) \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(a_{t}(r), b_{t}(r)\right), \quad \phi_{t}(r) \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(\alpha_{t}(r), \beta_{t}(r)\right),
$$

where $a_{t}(r), \ldots$ depend on both time $t$ and location $r$, For movement probabilities/Markov transitions $\psi_{t}(r)=\left(\psi_{t}(r, s) ; s \in \mathfrak{K}\right)$,

$$
\psi_{t}(r) \sim \mathscr{D} i r\left(\gamma_{t}(r)\right),
$$

since

$$
\sum_{s \in \mathfrak{K}} \psi_{t}(r, s)=1
$$

where $\gamma_{t}(r)=\left(\gamma_{t}(r, s) ; s \in \mathfrak{K}\right)$.

## lizards

Capture-recapture experiment on the migrations of lizards between three adjacent zones, with are six capture episodes.

Prior information provided by biologists on $p_{t}$ (which are assumed to be zone independent) and $\phi_{t}(r)$, in the format of prior expectations and prior confidence intervals.

Differences in prior on $p_{t}$ due to differences in capture efforts differences between episodes $1,3,5$ and 2,4 due to different mortality rates over winter.

Capture-recapture experiments
Arnason-Schwarz's Model

## Prior information

|  | Episode | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $p_{t}$ | Mean | $\begin{gathered} 0.3 \\ {[0.1,0.5]} \end{gathered}$ | 0.4 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 0.2 |
|  | 95\% int. |  | [0.2,0.6] | [0.3,0.7] | [0.05, 0.4] | [0.05, 0.4 ] |
|  | Site Episode |  | A |  |  | B, C |
|  |  | $\mathrm{t}=1,3,5$ |  | $\mathrm{t}=2,4$ | $\mathrm{t}=1,3,5$ | $\mathrm{t}=2,4$ |
| $\phi_{t}(r)$ | Mean | 0.7 |  | 0.65 | 0.7 | 0.7 |
|  | $95 \%$ int. | [0.4,0.95] |  | [0.35,0.9] | [0.4, 0.95 ] | [0.4,0.95] |

Capture-recapture experiments

## - Arnason-Schwarz's Model

## Prior equivalence

Prior information that can be translated in a collection of beta priors

| Episode | 2 | 3 | 4 |  | 5 | 6 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dist. | $\mathscr{B} e(6,14)$ | $\mathscr{B} e(8,12)$ | $e(12,12)$ | $\mathscr{B} e(3.5,14)$ | $\mathscr{B} e(3.5,14)$ |  |
| Site |  |  |  |  |  | A |
| $\mathrm{t}=2,4$ | $\mathrm{t}=1,3,5$ | B | $\mathrm{t}=2,4$ |  |  |  |
| Episode | $\mathrm{t}=1,3,5$ |  | $\mathrm{t}=2.4$ |  |  |  |
| Dist. | $\mathscr{B} e(6.0,2.5)$ | $e(6.5,3.5)$ | $\mathscr{B} e(6.0,2.5)$ | $\mathscr{B} e(6.0,2.5)$ |  |  |

## eurodip

Prior belief that the capture and survival rates should be constant over time

$$
p_{t}(r)=p(r) \quad \text { and } \quad \phi_{t}(r)=\phi(r)
$$

Assuming in addition that movement probabilities are time-independent,

$$
\psi_{t}(r)=\psi(r)
$$

we are left with $3[p(r)]+3[\phi(r)]+3 \times 2\left[\phi_{t}(r)\right]=12$ parameters.
Use non-informative priors with

$$
a(r)=b(r)=\alpha(r)=\beta(r)=\gamma(r, s)=1
$$

## Gibbs sampling

Needs to account for the missing parts in the $\mathbf{z}_{i}$ 's, in order to simulate the parameters from the full conditional distributions

$$
\pi(\theta \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}) \propto \ell(\theta \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}) \times \pi(\theta)
$$

where $\mathbf{x}$ and $\mathbf{z}$ are the collections of the vectors of capture indicators and locations.

Particular case of data augmentation, where the missing data $\mathbf{z}$ is simulated at each step $t$ in order to reconstitute a complete sample $\left(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(t)}\right)$ with two steps:

- Parameter simulation
- Missing location simulation


## Arnason-Schwarz Gibbs sampler

## Algorithm

Iteration $l(l \geq 1)$
(1) Parameter simulation
simulate $\theta^{(l)} \sim \pi\left(\theta \mid \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)}, \mathbf{x}\right)$ as $(t=1, \ldots, \tau)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& p_{t}^{(l)}(r) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(a_{t}(r)+u_{t}(r), b_{t}(r)+v_{t}^{(l)}(r)\right) \\
& \phi_{t}^{(l)}(r) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} \sim \mathscr{B} e\left(\alpha_{t}(r)+\sum_{j \in \mathfrak{K}} w_{t}^{(l)}(r, j), \beta_{t}(r)+w_{t}^{(l)}(r, \dagger)\right) \\
& \psi_{t}^{(l)}(r) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} \sim \mathscr{D} i r\left(\gamma_{t}(r, s)+w_{t}^{(l)}(r, s) ; s \in \mathfrak{K}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Arnason-Schwarz Gibbs sampler (cont'd)

## where

$$
\begin{aligned}
w_{t}^{(l)}(r, s) & =\sum_{i=1}^{n} \mathbb{I}_{\left(z_{(i, t)}^{(l-1)}=r, z_{(i, t+1)}^{(l-1)}=s\right)} \\
u_{t}^{(l)}(r) & =\sum_{i=1}^{n} \mathbb{I}_{\left(x_{(i, t)}=1, z_{(i, t)}^{(l-1)}=r\right)} \\
v_{t}^{(l)}(r) & =\sum_{i=1}^{n} \mathbb{I}_{\left(x_{(i, t)}=0, z_{(i, t)}^{(l-1)}=r\right)}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Arnason-Schwarz Gibbs sampler (cont'd)

## (2) Missing location simulation

generate the unobserved $z_{(i, t)}^{(l)}$ 's from the full conditional distributions

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathbb{P}\left(z_{(i, 1)}^{(l)}=\right. & \left.s \mid x_{(i, 1)}, z_{(i, 2)}^{(l-1)}, \theta^{(l)}\right) \propto q_{1}^{(l)}\left(s, z_{(i, 2)}^{(l-1)}\right)\left(1-p_{1}^{(l)}(s)\right), \\
\mathbb{P}\left(z_{(i, t)}^{(l)}=\right. & \left.s \mid x_{(i, t)}, z_{(i, t-1)}^{(l)}, z_{(i, t+1)}^{(l-1)}, \theta^{(l)}\right) \propto q_{t-1}^{(l)}\left(z_{(i, t-1)}^{(l)}, s\right) \\
& \quad \times q_{t}\left(s, z_{(i, t+1)}^{(l-1)}\right)\left(1-p_{t}^{(l)}(s)\right), \\
\mathbb{P}\left(z_{(i, \tau)}^{(l)}=\right. & \left.s \mid x_{(i, \tau)}, z_{(i, \tau-1)}^{(l)}, \theta^{(l)}\right) \propto q_{\tau-1}^{(l)}\left(z_{(i, \tau-1)}^{(l)}, s\right)\left(1-p_{\tau}(s)^{(l)}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Gibbs sampler illustrated

Take $\mathfrak{K}=\{1,2\}, n=4, m=8$ and ,for $\mathbf{x}$,

| 1 | 1 | 1 | . | . | 1 | . | . | . |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 1 | . | 1 | . | 1 | . | 2 | 1 |
| 3 | 2 | 1 | . | 1 | 2 | . | . | 1 |
| 4 | 1 | . | . | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 |

Take all hyperparameters equal to 1

## Gibbs sampler illust'd (cont'd)

One instance of simulated $\mathbf{z}$ is

| 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | $\dagger$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 |

which leads to the simulation of the parameters:

$$
\begin{aligned}
p_{4}^{(l)}(1) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} & \sim \mathscr{B} e(1+2,1+0) \\
\phi_{7}^{(l)}(2) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} & \sim \mathscr{B} e(1+0,1+1) \\
\psi_{2}^{(l)}(1,2) \mid \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}^{(l-1)} & \sim \mathscr{B} e(1+1,1+2)
\end{aligned}
$$

in the Gibbs sampler.
$\left\llcorner_{\text {Capture-recapture experiments }}\right.$
L Arnason-Schwarz's Model

## eurodip

## Fast convergence








